

# Computability

*Computable Functions, Logic, and  
the Foundations of Mathematics*

3rd edition

Richard L. Epstein

Walter A. Carnielli

**Advanced Reasoning Forum**

Socorro, New Mexico, USA



ARF

COPYRIGHT © 2008 Richard L. Epstein and Walter Carnielli

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. No part of this work covered by the copyright hereon may be reproduced or used in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, taping, Web distribution, information storage and retrieval systems, or in any other manner—without the written permission of the authors.

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted.

For more information contact:

Advanced Reasoning Forum  
P. O. Box 635  
Socorro, NM 87801 USA  
<arf@AdvancedReasoningForum.org>



**ARF**

**ISBN 978-0-9815507-2-5**

# Contents

## I The FUNDAMENTALS

### 1 Paradoxes

A. Self-Referential Paradoxes . . . . .	3
B. Zeno's Paradoxes . . . . .	5
Exercises . . . . .	6

### 2 What Do the Paradoxes Mean?

(Optional)

A. Philosophy and Mathematics . . . . .	7
B. Achilles and the Tortoise Revisited . . . . .	12
Exercises . . . . .	17

### 3 Whole Numbers

A. Counting (Ordinal) vs. Quantity (Cardinal) . . . . .	18
B. Number is All: $\sqrt{2}$ . . . . .	19
Exercises . . . . .	20

### 4 Functions

A. What Is a Function?	
1. Black boxes . . . . .	21
2. Domains and ranges . . . . .	22
3. Functions as rules, functions as collections of ordered pairs . . . . .	23
B. Terminology and Notation	
1. The $\lambda$ -notation . . . . .	24
2. One-one and onto functions . . . . .	25
3. Composition of functions . . . . .	26
Exercises . . . . .	27

### 5 Proofs

A. What Is a Proof? . . . . .	28
B. Induction . . . . .	29
C. Proof by Contradiction ( <i>Reductio ad Absurdum</i> ) . . . . .	31
D. Proof by Construction . . . . .	31
E. Proof by Counterexample . . . . .	32
F. On Existence Proofs . . . . .	32
G. The Nature of Proof: Certainty and Existence (Optional)	
1. From "Mathematical proofs: the genesis of reasonable doubt" by Gina Bari Kolata . . . . .	33

2. The Introduction to <i>Constructive Formalism</i> by R.L. Goodstein (Concluded) . . . . .	35
Exercises . . . . .	36
<b>6 Infinite Collections?</b>	
A. How Big Is Infinite? . . . . .	38
B. Enumerability: The Rationals Are Countable . . . . .	39
C. The Reals Are Not Countable . . . . .	40
D. Power Sets and the Set of All Sets . . . . .	41
Exercises . . . . .	41
<b>7 Hilbert “On the Infinite”</b>	
(Optional) . . . . .	44
Exercises . . . . .	58

## II COMPUTABLE FUNCTIONS

<b>8 Computability</b>	
A. Algorithms . . . . .	63
B. General Criteria for Algorithms	
1. Mal’cev’s criteria, from <i>Algorithms and Recursive Functions</i> . . . . .	64
2. Hermes, from <i>Enumerability, Decidability, Computability</i> . . . . .	65
C. Numbering . . . . .	68
D. Algorithm vs. Algorithmic Function . . . . .	69
E. Approaches to Formalizing Computability . . . . .	70
Exercises . . . . .	71
<b>9 Turing Machines</b>	
A. Turing on Computability (Optional) . . . . .	72
B. Descriptions and Examples of Turing Machines . . . . .	75
C. Turing Machines and Functions . . . . .	78
Exercises . . . . .	83
<b>10 The Most Amazing Fact and Church's Thesis</b>	
A. The Most Amazing Fact . . . . .	85
B. Emil L. Post on Computability (Optional) . . . . .	86
<b>11 Primitive Recursive Functions</b>	
A. Definition by Induction . . . . .	91
B. The Definition of the Primitive Recursive Functions	
1. Basic (initial) functions . . . . .	92
2. Basic operations . . . . .	92
3. An inductive definition of the class of functions . . . . .	93
C. Examples	
1. The constants . . . . .	93
2. Addition . . . . .	94
3. Multiplication . . . . .	94

4. Exponentiation . . . . .	94
5. Signature and zero test . . . . .	95
6. Half . . . . .	95
7. Predecessor and limited subtraction . . . . .	95
Exercises Part 1 . . . . .	96
D. Other Operations That Are Primitive Recursive	
1. Addition and multiplication of functions . . . . .	97
2. Functions defined according to conditions . . . . .	97
3. Predicates and logical operations . . . . .	98
4. Bounded minimization . . . . .	99
5. Existence and universality below a bound . . . . .	100
6. Iteration . . . . .	100
7. Simultaneously defined functions . . . . .	100
8. Course-of-values induction . . . . .	101
E. Prime Numbers for Codings . . . . .	101
F. Numbering the Primitive Recursive Functions . . . . .	103
G. Why Primitive Recursive $\neq$ Computable . . . . .	104
Exercises Part 2 . . . . .	104

## 12 The Grzegorzcyk Hierarchy

(Optional)

A. Hierarchies and Bounded Recursion . . . . .	107
B. The Elementary Functions . . . . .	109
C. Iterating Iteration: The Ackermann-Péter Function	
1. The functions $\psi_m$ and proof by double induction . . . . .	110
2. Dominating the primitive recursive functions . . . . .	111
3. The Ackermann-Péter function and nested double recursion . . . . .	112
D. The Grzegorzcyk Hierarchy . . . . .	114
Exercises . . . . .	115

## 13 Multiple Recursion

(Optional)

A. The Multiply Recursive Functions	
1. Double recursion . . . . .	117
2. $n$ -fold recursion . . . . .	118
3. Diagonalizing the multiply recursive functions . . . . .	119
B. Recursion on Order Types . . . . .	119

## 14 The Least Search Operator

A. The $\mu$ -Operator . . . . .	122
B. The min-Operator . . . . .	122
C. The $\mu$ -Operator Is a Computable Operation . . . . .	123

## 15 Partial Recursive Functions

A. The Partial Recursive Functions . . . . .	124
B. Diagonalization and the Halting Problem . . . . .	125
C. The General Recursive Functions . . . . .	126

D. Gödel on Partial Functions . . . . .	126
Exercises . . . . .	127
<b>16 Numbering the Partial Recursive Functions</b>	
A. Why and How: The Idea . . . . .	128
B. Indices for the Partial Recursive Functions . . . . .	129
C. Algorithmic Classes (Optional) . . . . .	130
D. The Universal Computation Predicate . . . . .	131
E. The Normal Form Theorem . . . . .	133
F. The $s$ - $m$ - $n$ Theorem . . . . .	134
G. The Fixed Point Theorem . . . . .	135
Exercises . . . . .	136
<b>17 Listability</b>	
A. Listability and Recursively Enumerable Sets . . . . .	139
B. Domains of Partial Recursive Functions . . . . .	141
C. The Projection Theorem . . . . .	142
Exercises . . . . .	142
<b>18 Turing Machine Computable = Partial Recursive (Optional)</b>	
A. Partial Recursive Implies Turing Machine Computable . . . . .	144
B. Turing Machine Computable Implies Partial Recursive . . . . .	146
 <b>III LOGIC and ARITHMETIC</b>	
<b>19 Propositional Logic</b>	
A. Hilbert's Program Revisited . . . . .	153
B. Formal Systems . . . . .	154
C. Propositional Logic	
1. The formal language . . . . .	154
2. Truth and falsity: truth-tables for the connectives . . . . .	155
3. Validity . . . . .	157
D. Decidability of Validity	
1. Checking for validity . . . . .	157
2. Decidability . . . . .	158
E. Axiomatizing Propositional Logic . . . . .	161
F. Proving As a Computable Procedure . . . . .	164
Appendix (Optional)	
1. The Unique Readability Theorem . . . . .	165
2. The Completeness Theorem for Classical Propositional Logic . . . . .	166
Exercises . . . . .	168
<b>20 An Overview of First-Order Logic and Gödel's Theorems . . . . .</b>	<b>169</b>
<b>21 First-Order Arithmetic</b>	
A. A Formal Language for Arithmetic . . . . .	174

1. Variables . . . . .	174
2. Arithmetic functions and terms . . . . .	174
3. Numerals in unary notation . . . . .	175
4. Quantifiers: existence and universality . . . . .	175
5. The formal language . . . . .	176
6. The standard interpretation and axiomatizing . . . . .	177
B. Principles of Reasoning and Logical Axioms	
1. Closed wffs and the rule of generalization . . . . .	177
2. The propositional connectives . . . . .	179
3. Substitution for a variable . . . . .	179
4. Distributing the universal quantifier . . . . .	179
5. Equality . . . . .	180
6. More principles? . . . . .	180
C. The Axiom System $\mathcal{Q}$	
1. The axioms . . . . .	180
2. On consistency and truth . . . . .	182
D. $\exists$ -Introduction and Properties of $=$ : Some Proofs in $\mathcal{Q}$ . . . . .	182
E. Weakness of System $\mathcal{Q}$ . . . . .	184
F. Proving As a Computable Procedure . . . . .	185
Exercises . . . . .	186

## 22 Functions Representable in Formal Arithmetic

A. Dispensing with Primitive Recursion . . . . .	189
1. A digression on number theory . . . . .	190
2. A characterization of the partial recursive functions . . . . .	191
B. The Recursive Functions Are Representable in $\mathcal{Q}$ . . . . .	192
C. The Functions Representable in $\mathcal{Q}$ Are Recursive . . . . .	199
D. Representability of Recursive Predicates . . . . .	200
Exercises . . . . .	201

## 23 The Undecidability of Arithmetic

A. $\mathcal{Q}$ Is Undecidable . . . . .	202
B. Theories of Arithmetic	
1. Fragments simpler than $\mathcal{Q}$ . . . . .	203
2. Theories . . . . .	203
3. Axiomatizable theories . . . . .	204
4. Functions representable in a theory . . . . .	204
5. Undecidable theories . . . . .	205
C. Peano Arithmetic ( $PA$ ) and <i>Arithmetic</i> . . . . .	205
Exercises . . . . .	208

## 24 The Unprovability of Consistency

A. Self-Reference in Arithmetic: The Liar Paradox . . . . .	210
B. The Unprovability of Consistency . . . . .	212
C. Historical Remarks . . . . .	216
Exercises . . . . .	218

# IV CHURCH'S THESIS, CONSTRUCTIVE MATHEMATICS, and MATHEMATICS AS MODELING

## 25 Church's Thesis

A. History . . . . .	223
B. A Definition or a Thesis?	
1. On definitions . . . . .	226
2. Kalmár, from "An argument against the plausibility of Church's Thesis" . . . . .	227
3. A platonist perspective: Gödel . . . . .	228
4. Other examples: definitions or theses? . . . . .	229
5. On the use of Church's Thesis . . . . .	230
C. Arguments For and Against	
1. For . . . . .	231
2. Not every recursive function is computable: theoretical vs. actual computability . . . . .	232
3. Interpretation of the quantifiers in the thesis/definition . . . . .	234
4. A paradoxical consequence? . . . . .	235
D. Interpreting the Evidence . . . . .	237
Exercises . . . . .	238

## 26 Constructivist Views of Mathematics . . . . . 239

A. Intuitionism	
1. L. E. J. Brouwer, from "Intuitionism and formalism", 1913 . . . . .	240
2. Modern intuitionism . . . . .	246
B. Recursive Analysis . . . . .	248
C. Bishop's Constructivism	
1. Errett Bishop, from <i>Foundations of Constructive Analysis</i> . . . . .	249
2. Some definitions from Bishop's program . . . . .	254
D. Criticisms of Intuitionism and Bishop's Constructivism	
1. Paul Bernays on intuitionism . . . . .	255
2. Nicolas Goodman, from "Reflections on Bishop's philosophy of mathematics" . . . . .	256
E. Strict Finitism	
1. D. van Dantzig, "Is $10^{10^{10}}$ a finite number?" . . . . .	260
2. David Isles, from "Remarks on the notion of standard non-isomorphic natural number series" . . . . .	263
Exercises . . . . .	270

## 27 Mathematics as Modeling

Richard L. Epstein, "On mathematics" . . . . .	273
--	-----

## COMPUTABILITY and UNDECIDABILITY—A Timeline . 305

<i>Bibliography</i> . . . . .	333
-------------------------------	-----

<i>Glossary and Index of Notation</i> . . . . .	347
---	-----

<i>Index</i> . . . . .	349
------------------------	-----



# Preface

Why was the theory of computable functions developed before there were any computers?

The formal theory of computable functions and their relation to logic arose as a response to the ferment in the foundations of mathematics at the beginning of this century. The paradoxes of self-reference and the question of how or even whether we are justified in using infinite sets stood at the center of that development, and those paradoxes are no less interesting, nor settled, now. Along with readings from the originators of the subject, the paradoxes and doubts about the infinite serve to motivate the study of the technical mathematics in this book and place the mathematics in its history.

Some mathematicians may prefer a straight mathematical development; for that Part II, *Computable Functions*, and Part III, *Logic and Arithmetic*, will suffice. In Part II we describe the notion of computability, present the Turing machine model, and then develop the theory of partial recursive functions as far as the Normal Form Theorem. In Part III we begin with propositional logic and give an overview of predicate logic and Gödel's theorems, which can serve as a summary for a short course. A full development of the syntactic part of first-order logic and Gödel's theorems then follows. Part I, *The Fundamentals*, can be referred to for notation and basic proof techniques.

Philosophy, however, has been the motive for much of logic and computability. In Part I we give the philosophical background for discussions about the foundations of mathematics while presenting the notions of whole number, function, proof, and real number. Hilbert's paper "On the infinite" sets the stage for the analysis of computability in Part II. In Part IV we consider the significance of the technical work with discussions of Church's Thesis, constructivity in mathematics, and mathematics as modeling.

Many exercises are included, beginning gently in Part I and progressing to a graduate level in the final chapters. The most difficult ones, marked with a dagger †, may be skipped, although all are intended to be read. Solutions to the exercises can be found in the Instructor's Manual (available from the Advanced Reasoning Forum, [www.AdvancedReasoningForum.org](http://www.AdvancedReasoningForum.org)), which also contains suggestions for course outlines. Sections marked "Optional" are not essential for the technical development of chapters which follow, although they often provide important motivation.

*For the second edition:* Beyond the addition of a timeline on computability and undecidability written by Epstein, we have confined our changes almost entirely to technical corrections, adding only two new quotes from Gödel (p. 173 and p. 215). One noteworthy change is the replacement of Fermat's Last Theorem by Goldbach's Conjecture as an example of an unsolved arithmetic problem used in several examples; the former has been shown to be true by Andrew Wiles, "Modular elliptic curves and Fermat's Last Theorem", *Annals of Mathematics*, second series, vol. 141, 1995, pp. 443–551. Where other authors have used Fermat's Last Theorem as an example (Arend Heyting on p. 234, Nicholas Goodman on p. 259), a similar substitution of Goldbach's Conjecture would make the same point.

*For the third edition:* We have added a chapter that gives a very different view of mathematics than in the other articles in the text, viewing mathematics as modeling and not (necessarily) in need of foundations. It is the view that underlies our presentation of the mathematics in this book.

We have made only minor corrections to the body of the text, retaining the same pagination. A few small corrections have been made to the timeline.

The story we tell leaves no room to include a presentation of the semantics of classical predicate logic. That material is now available in a companion to this volume, Epstein's *Classical Mathematical Logic*, Princeton University Press, 2006.

## Acknowledgments

We are grateful to the following organizations for their help in the writing of this book: Victoria University of Wellington for a post-doctoral fellowship for Richard Epstein in 1975–1977, during which the notes for a course on recursive function theory for the Philosophy Department were developed that became the basis for this book; the Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado de São Paulo, Brazil, which sponsored our collaboration in Brazil and the United States in 1984–1985; the Fulbright Commission for allowing us to continue that collaboration by awarding a fellowship to Richard L. Epstein to work at the University of Campinas, Brazil, from January to June of 1987; and the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation of the Federal Republic of Germany for awarding a fellowship to Walter A. Carnielli for 1988–1989, during which final revisions were made to the text.

We are especially pleased to have this opportunity to thank the many people who have helped us. Max Dickmann, Justus Diller, Benson Mates, Piergiorgio Odifreddi, A.S. Troelstra, and our students Sandra de Amo, Karl Henderscheid, João Meidanis, and Homero Schneider read and suggested many important improvements to the text. Oswaldo Chateaubriand and Peter Eggenberger cleared up much of our confusion about Church’s Thesis. The following persons served as reviewers of the text for the first edition and offered many useful suggestions: Herbert Enderton, F. Golshani, Roger Maddux, Mark Mahowald, Bernard Moret, Fred Richman, Rick Smith, Stephen Thomason, and V.J. Vazirani. Finally, we are indebted to our editor for the first edition, John Kimmel, and production editors Nancy Shammass and Bill Bokermann, and to Peter Adams, our editor for the second edition, through whose patience and persistence this became a better text. To all these, and any others whom we may have inadvertently forgotten, our thanks.

Each author wishes to indicate that any mistakes still left in this text are not due to those above who have so generously helped us, but are due entirely to the other author.

*For the third edition:* We are grateful to Howard Blair, Carlos Augusto Di Prisco, Ricardo Gazoni, Leon Harkleroad, David Isles, and Carolyn Kernberger for their corrections and suggestions for improving the text. We hope that we have introduced no new errors in correcting the old ones.

Richard L. Epstein is also grateful to the following people whose comments greatly helped in the preparation of the timeline: Irving Anellis, Walter Carnielli, William Craig, Martin Davis, Peter Eggenberger, Rogéria Gaudencio, Ivor Grattan-Guinness, Leon Harkleroad, David Isles, Benson Mates, Gregory Moore, Piergiorgio Odifreddi, Jerzy Perzanowski, Clara Helena Sánchez, Stewart Shapiro, Peter Simons, Stanisław Surma, Lesław Szczerba, Jan Wolenski, Jan Zygmunt.

## Publishing Acknowledgments

(Full references to the papers and books below may be found in the Bibliography.)

Quotations from Robert J. Baum, *Philosophy and Mathematics*, reprinted with permission of the publisher, Freeman Cooper and Co., San Francisco, California. Copyright ©1973.

Quotations from *Constructive Analysis* by E. Bishop and D. Bridges reprinted with permission of the publisher. Copyright ©1985 Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg.

Quotations from “Intuitionism and formalism” by L. E. J. Brouwer reprinted with permission from the Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society. © 1913.

The “Letter to Descartes,” by R. C. Buck, reprinted with permission of the publisher, The Mathematical Association of America. Copyright © 1978.

Quotations from “On undecidable propositions of formal mathematical systems,” from lectures delivered by Kurt Gödel in 1934. Reprinted with permission of the Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, literary executors of the estate of Kurt Gödel.

Quotations from “Reflections on Bishop’s philosophy of mathematics,” by Nicolas D. Goodman, reprinted with permission of the publisher, Springer-Verlag. Copyright © 1981, Lecture Notes in Mathematics, vol. 873.

The Introduction to *Constructive Formalism*, by R. L. Goodstein, reprinted with permission of the publisher, University College, Leicester. Copyright © 1951.

Quotations from *Enumerability, Decidability, Computability*, by Hans Hermes, reprinted with permission of the publisher. Copyright © 1969 Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg.

“On the infinite,” by David Hilbert, was first delivered on June 4, 1925, before a congress of the Westphalian Mathematical Society in Münster, in honor of Karl Weierstrass. Translated by Erna Putnam and Gerald J. Massey from *Mathematischen Annalen* (Berlin) no. 95 (1926) pp. 161–190. Permission for the translation and inclusion of the article in this volume was kindly granted by the publishers, Springer-Verlag.

Quotations from “Remarks on the notion of standard non-isomorphic natural number series,” by David Isles, reprinted with permission of the author. Copyright © 1981.

Quotations from *Introduction to Metamathematics*, by Stephen C. Kleene, reprinted with permission of the publisher, North-Holland. Copyright © 1952.

“Mathematical proofs: the genesis of reasonable doubt,” by Gina Bari Kolata, *Science*, vol. 192, pp. 989–990, 4 June 1976, by the A.A.A.S. Reprinted with permission.

“Finite combinatory processes—formulation I,” by Emil Post, reprinted with permission of the Association for Symbolic Logic. Copyright © 1936.

Quotations from Joseph R. Shoenfield, *Mathematical Logic*, © 1967, Addison-Wesley Publishing Co., Inc., Reading, Massachusetts, p. 214. Reprinted by permission.

Quotations from “On computable numbers, with an application to the Entscheidungsproblem,” by Alan M. Turing, published in the *Proceedings of the London Mathematical Society*, ser. 2, vol. 42, 1936–1937. Reprinted by permission of Oxford University Press.

“Is  $10^{10^{10}}$  a finite number?,” by D. van Dantzig, reprinted with permission of the editors of *Dialectica*. Copyright © 1956.

Quotations from *From Mathematics to Philosophy*, by Hao Wang, reprinted with permission of the publisher, Routledge and Kegan Paul. Copyright © 1974.

A previous version of Chapter 27 appeared at CLE e-Prints, Vol. 8(3), 2001 (Section Logic), /www.cle.unicamp.br/e-prints/vol\_8,n\_3,2008.html.